



*For Immediate Release: December 15, 2022*

*Press Contact: [press@mtaig.org](mailto:press@mtaig.org)*

**Office of the MTA Inspector General Finds Maintenance and Communication Issues Impacted Restoration of Camera Network Outage Preceding the April 12, 2022 Subway Shooting in Sunset Park, Brooklyn**

*Investigation reveals outage began four days earlier, went unnoticed for 24 hours*

*When the outage was discovered, confusing and inadequate reporting protocols further confounded efforts to promptly repair it*

The Office of the MTA Inspector General announced today the findings of an inquiry into the camera network outage on April 12, 2022 during a subway shooting near the 36<sup>th</sup> Street Station in Sunset Park, Brooklyn. The investigation found that shortfalls in staffing, maintenance, and internal controls significantly delayed both the discovery that the video was not streaming and the eventual repair of the network. Furthermore, the OIG found no evidence that the outage at the affected stations was intentional.

While the exact reason for the network failure remains unknown, OIG's inquiry found that the video stream at three stations went down at 5:21 PM on Friday, April 8. However, this outage was not discovered by NYC Transit workers for 24 hours, and even then, the group responsible for maintaining the network was not aware of the outage for an additional two days.

In addition, the inquiry found:

- Limited staffing caused delays in discovery and repair of problems, which did not begin until the morning of Monday, April 11.
- The workforce tasked with maintaining the camera network equipment was insufficiently trained.
- The maintenance protocol for the network equipment was deficient.

“This is about maintenance. Investment in technology is critical but without a matching commitment to maintenance, the gains from the investment are fleeting,” **said Acting Inspector General Elizabeth Keating**. “The staffing shortfall in maintenance positions is real and a much broader problem impacting NYC Transit operations.”

In response to OIG’s draft findings and 12 recommendations, NYC Transit has taken steps to address the concerns raised during the inquiry. According to NYC Transit, they have already implemented a formal, reporting protocol for maintenance issues. NYC Transit has also begun to transition to a software system that better tracks maintenance and generates work orders.

Following the shooting, NYPD issued a statement that other MTA cameras provided useful footage that day and praised the great efforts made by personnel across the MTA to assist in their investigation.

The report is based on interviews of over 40 individuals, including NYC Transit employees responsible for maintaining the streaming cameras and their network, NYC Transit Security personnel, and representatives of the network equipment manufacturer. Further, OIG reviewed and analyzed the network system logs for the streaming cameras; and OIG reviewed maintenance records maintained by NYC Transit, reports produced by the network equipment manufacturer, the network equipment manuals, and other materials and information provided by NYC Transit and MTA Construction and Development.

The review was conducted by members of OIG’s Legal and Audit units, including, Senior Investigative Attorney Elise Roecker, Senior Investigative Attorney Laura Wexler, Audit Manager Navon Hirshaut, Construction Auditor/Engineering Timothy Dennis, and Staff Auditor Vinny Lam.

[The OIG’s report, including findings and recommendations, is available here.](#)

<https://mtaig.state.ny.us/Reports/2022-12.pdf>

The MTA Inspector General encourages all members of the public to reach out with complaints, tips, or to report fraud via the Office’s confidential tip reporting portals: Online (<http://mtaig.state.ny.us/ComplaintForm.aspx>), Phone (1-800-MTA-IG4U or 1-800-682-4448) or Email ([Complaints@mtaig.org](mailto:Complaints@mtaig.org)).

Follow us on social media:

 [MTAOIG](#)

 [MTAOIG](#)

 [MTA Inspector General](#)

 [MTA Inspector General](#)

####